

Canadian Journal of Urban Research
Revue canadienne de recherche urbaine

Canadian Institute of Planners
Institut canadien des urbanistes

Association of Canadian University Planning Programs
Association des programmes universitaires canadiens en urbanisme

CANADIAN PLANNING AND POLICY *Aménagement et politique au Canada*

JOINT ISSUE / PUBLICATION CONJOINTE

EDITOR

Dave L. A. Gordon

School of Urban and Regional Planning, *Queen's University*

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

Marc Vachon

Geography Department, *University of Winnipeg*

EDITORIAL BOARD – JOINT ISSUE

David F. Brown

School of Urban Planning, *McGill University*

Dave L. A. Gordon

School of Urban and Regional Planning, *Queen's University*

Ryan Walker

Department of Geography and Planning, *University of Saskatchewan*

Printed by

Derksen Printers
377 Main Street
Steinbach, MB R5G 1A5

Cover

Golsa Kheir Moghadam

Layout and Typesetting

Frederick Edwards

©2013 Institute of Urban Studies

ISSN: 1188-3774

Publication of this journal is partially funded by the University of Winnipeg, The Canadian Institute of Planners, and the Association of Canadian University Planning Programs, but views expressed are the personal views of the author(s) and the University and the Institute accept no responsibility for them.

CANADIAN PLANNING AND POLICY

Aménagement et politique au Canada

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

Editor's Introduction / L'introduction du rédacteur David L. A. Gordon	iii
The Crown Duty to Consult and Ontario Municipal-First Nations Relations: Lessons learned from the Red Hill Valley Parkway Project Clara MacCallum Fraser and Leela Viswanathan	1
Capacity needs for source water protection plan implementation: Lessons from the South Saskatchewan River Frances X. Rawlyk and Robert J. Patrick	20
Sustainability Plans in British Columbia: Instruments of Change or Token Gestures? Mark R. Stevens and Alisha Z. D. Mody	46
Can form-based code help reduce municipal greenhouse gas emissions in small towns? The case of Revelstoke, British Columbia Maged Senbel, Mike van der Laan, Ron Kellett, Cynthia Girling, and Jessica Stuart	72
Shifting from Vision to Reality: Perspectives on Regional Food Policies and Food System Planning Barriers at the Local Level Jessica Wegener, Mark Seasons, and Kim D. Raine	93

CANADIAN PLANNING AND POLICY

Aménagement et politique au Canada

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BOOK REVIEWS

<i>Hard Choices: Financial Exclusion, Fringe Banks and Poverty in Urban Canada</i> Jerry Buckland	113
<i>City Planning as Ideology and Practice: Selected Speeches by Dr. Earl Levin</i> Michael Dudley, Editor	115
<i>Heat Islands: Understanding and Mitigating Heat in Urban Areas</i> Lisa Gartland	118
<i>The Merger Delusion: How Swallowing Its Suburbs Made an Even Bigger Mess of Montreal</i> Peter F. Trent	119

Moving from Theory to Practice: Research that examines implementation of Canadian plans

This volume of *Canadian Planning and Policy* (CPP) is the tenth in collaboration between the Canadian Institute of Planners (CIP), the Association of Canadian University Planning Programs (ACUPP), and the *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* (CJUR). The monograph is a deliberate link between the Canadian planning academy and our professional planners' national institute, and between theory and practice.

As it happens, most of the articles in this year's monograph address implementation issues for Canadian plans. This is not an accident, since CPP seeks out research that informs professional practice and plan implementation certainly fits that mandate. Monitoring and implementing plans is a field that is under-researched (Baer 1997; Berke et al. 2006; Talen 1996) and Canadian studies are relatively rare (Linovski and Loukaitou-Sideris 2013; Seasons 2002).

Clara Fraser MacCallum and Leela Viswanathan start this year's issue with a case study of one of the most difficult Canadian land use policy issues—How should we implement the Crown duty to consult First Nations? This issue has confounded federal and provincial planners for over a decade, but MacCallum and Viswanathan literally take the issue to a new level, considering how the duty to consult should be executed in municipal governments. They use Hamilton's Red Hill Valley Parkway as a case study to explore how municipal planners should consult First Nations communities in order to meet Crown obligations dating back to the Royal Proclamation of 1763. The municipal planners were operating without much guidance, since current legislation and court rulings are inadequate to guide professional practice. At the same time, most First Nations communities will require additional capacity-building if they are to meaningfully engage in the municipal planning process within the vast territories currently covered by outstanding land claims (Walker 2008).

Frances Rawlyk and Robert Patrick also identify needs for additional institutional capacity to implement plans protecting the sources of our drinking water.

Canadian Journal of Urban Research, Volume 22, Issue 1, Supplement pages iii-v.

Copyright © 2013 by the Institute of Urban Studies.

All rights of reproduction in any form reserved.

ISSN: 1188-3774

Although the deaths in Walkerton focused Ontario's attention to the need for source water protection (SWP), this issue is even more important in the Prairie provinces, where half the urban population of Alberta and Saskatchewan depend upon the water from a single river system: the South Saskatchewan. Rawlyk and Patrick's case study of that river basin find that most of the agencies responsible for SWP implementation needed better data, improved training, more enforcement powers and tighter linkages to other organisations.

Mark Stevens and Alisha Mody evaluate twenty municipal sustainability plans in British Columbia. Practicing planners often have difficulty identifying exactly what sustainability should mean and how the concept should be implemented. Stevens and Mody evaluated a broad sample of documents against a set of 38 factors that promote implementation of plans. They found that most plans contained weak provisions for implementation efforts and little monitoring of results. The authors provide direct and useful recommendations to ensure that sustainability goals and objectives are achieved in municipal plans.

More compact urban form is a common recommendation to achieve reduction in greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, which is a common municipal sustainability objective and a priority of the CIP's program to address climate change (Cappe & Brown 2010). A research team led by Maged Senbel examined a municipal form-based code as a tool to assist a small community to reduce GHG emissions. These codes are a smart growth tool that have replaced zoning bylaws and land-use districts in several hundred American municipalities, in hopes of creating more compact development patterns (Talen 2013). Their case study was Revelstoke BC, the first Canadian community to adopt a municipal form-based code. Senbel, van der Laan, Kellett, Girling and Stuart demonstrate that in a small city such as Revelstoke (2011 population 7100). Form-based codes may be an improvement compared to zoning for creating more compact form, but they are unlikely to change the development pattern in a sufficiently major way to produce the outcomes that needed to reduce absolute GHG emissions, such as sufficient density to support a shift from automobiles to public transit or from individual furnaces to district heating. The authors conclude that while there may be other compelling reasons to adopt form-based codes, reducing overall GHG emissions is an unlikely outcome in a small town, even under the densest development scenarios.

Finally, Jessica Wegener, Mark Seasons and Kim Raine help us understand implementation issues in local food systems planning, another current topic where the profession is just beginning to develop protocols. They use Waterloo Region as a case study to identify gaps and co-ordination issues in local, regional and provincial food policies. One of their more practical recommendations is that the term 'agriculture' be a separate land use with specific and supportive policies in local and regional plans. This simple and obvious change may be the first step to better food system planning in many municipalities that have underestimated their potential to assist local food production.

This annual publication, which is a collaborative effort between CIP, ACUPP, and CJUR, has a goal to provide a forum for detailed peer-reviewed research on planning in Canada that invites reflection by practitioners, academics, and students.

We also aim to publish this useful research in a timely fashion, to assist investigators in getting their results out to practitioners as soon as possible. Our editorial team has averaged 6-7 months from first submission to delivery of printed copies over the past five years, which is lightning-fast in an era of three-year publication marathons in other academic journals. This service is appreciated by researchers and we have received more good material than we could publish recently. So ACUPP has begun discussions with CIP to publish *Canadian Planning and Policy* more frequently, feature it on the revised CIP web site and to link it more closely with *Plan Canada*, which reaches every CIP member.

We look forward to another decade of service to the Canadian planning academy and profession.

David L.A. Gordon

Guest Editor, 2013 *Canadian Planning and Policy*

REFERENCES

- Baer, W.C. 1997. General plan evaluation criteria: An approach to making better plans. *Journal of the American Planning Association* 63 (3): 329-45.
- Berke, P., M. Backhurst, M. Day, N. Ericksen, L. Laurian, J. Crawford and J. Dixon. 2006. What makes plan implementation successful? An evaluation of local plans and implementation practices in New Zealand. *Environment and Planning B: Planning and Design* 33 (4): 581-600.
- Cappe, Marni and David Brown. 2010. "Mainstreaming Climate Change Tools for Planners", *Journal of the Alberta Association of the Canadian Institute of Planners*, Winter 2009/2010, pp 5-7.
- Linovski, Orly and Anastasia Loukaitou-Sideris. 2013. Evolution of Urban Design Plans in the United States and Canada: What Do the Plans Tell Us about Urban Design Practice? *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 33(1) 66-82
- Seasons, M. 2002. Evaluation and municipal urban planning: Practice and prospects. *Canadian Journal of Program Evaluation* 17 (1) 43-71.
- Talen, Emily. 1996. Do Plans Get Implemented? A Review of Evaluation in Planning, *Journal of Planning Literature*, 10:3 248-259.
- . 2013. Zoning For and Against Sprawl: The Case for Form-Based Codes, *Journal of Urban Design*. 18(2):175-200.
- Walker, R. C. 2008. Improving the Interface between Urban Municipalities and Aboriginal Communities. *Canadian Planning and Policy: Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 17(1) Supplement: 20-36